

CHAPTER 3: LEGAL ISSUES IN REDISTRICTING

ONE PERSON, ONE VOTE IN COUNTY ELECTIONS

The “one person, one vote” requirement arises under the equal protection clause of the United States Constitution and requires that members of a local elected body be drawn from districts of *substantially equal* population.⁶ Exact equality of population is not required.

PRINCIPLES OF ONE PERSON, ONE VOTE

Measuring Population Equality

“Substantially equal in population” is measured utilizing the following statistical methods:

1. *Ideal District Size.* Population equality is determined by calculating a district’s deviation from ideal district size. Ideal district size is determined by dividing the total population by the number of seats involved. Deviation is determined by calculating the extent to which an actual district is larger (has a “+” deviation) or smaller (has a “-” deviation) than the ideal district size. For example, the 2000 census reveals that ABC County has a total of 100,000 people with 10 supervisors, one for each district. The ideal population for each district is calculated as follows:

$$100,000 / 10 = 10,000 \text{ people per district}$$

2. *Calculating Relative Deviation from Ideal District Size.* Relative deviation is used to determine whether the 10% deviation rule (discussed below) has been achieved. Relative deviation is calculated by dividing the population deviation from the ideal population by the ideal population and is expressed in terms of a percentage. For example, if there is a 500-person deviation from the ideal population of 10,000 people, the relative deviation is calculated as follows:

$$500 \text{ (amount over ideal population)} / 10,000 \text{ (ideal population)} = .05 \text{ or } 5\%$$

3. *Overall Range.* Once the relative deviation is calculated for each individual district, the overall deviation range is determined. This statistic is calculated by determining the difference between districts with highest and lowest relative deviation. For example, if the highest and lowest deviations are +5% and -4% respectively, the overall range is 9%. Overall range is most commonly used in evaluating whether a district plan meets the one-person one, vote equal population standard.

Acceptable Deviation

1. *The 10% Rule.* The general rule that courts have applied in evaluating the constitutionality of redistricting is that districts should have a total population deviation of no more than 10% between the most populated district and the least populated district. Deviations below 10% in overall range are generally presumed to be constitutional. Deviations above 10% in overall range are presumed to be unconstitutional.

Courts have made exceptions to the 10% rule where a local government can demonstrate that legitimate reasons exist for the deviation. As such, the 10% rule is not hard and fast and must be considered in the particular facts and circumstances facing a local government in redistricting.

⁶ States may rely on total population (not only registered or eligible voters) to satisfy the one person, one vote requirement when drawing districts. *See Evenwel v. Abbott*, 136 S.Ct. 1120 (2016).