



Dane County

Minutes - Final Unless Amended by Committee

Public Works Sustainability Subcommittee

Wednesday, August 31, 2016

12:00 PM

City County Building Room 354

City County Building Room 354

A. Call To Order

*The meeting was called to order at 12:10 p.m. Sup. Hendrick present after item B1.
Also present: Clarke, Franz, MacKinnon, Welch.*

Present 7 - CHUCK ERICKSON, JOHN HENDRICK, JERRY MANDLI, ROBIN SCHMIDT,
DAVE MERRITT, CARLOS PABELLON, and DAVE RIPP

Excused 1 - KEVIN CONNORS

B. Consideration of Minutes

1. [2016 MIN-235](#) MINUTES OF THE 7/28/16 PUBLIC WORKS SUSTAINABILITY MEETING

Attachments: [2016 MIN-235](#)

A motion was made by RIPP, seconded by ERICKSON, that the minutes be approved. The motion carried by a voice vote.

C. Action Items

1. Review of increased bid on AEC high speed doors (2015 ACT-567)

2015
ACT-567

REVIEW AND SELECTION OF 2016 ROUND 1 SMART FUND
PROPOSALS - AEC Exhibition Hall Loading Dock High Speed Door

Attachments: [2015 ACT-567 AEC Load Dock](#)

[UPDATED SMART Fund Application - X Hall High Speed Doors Per Bids](#)

[UPDATED X Hall High Speed Door Savings Per Bids](#)

Mark Clarke and Bill Franz discussed the reasons for the increase in the project bid from the originally awarded \$160,000 to the new \$212,825. They indicated that the bid was higher than the original bid because the county's bidding policies would not allow them to get the bid direct from the supplier and use of a subcontractor increased the cost.

Subcommittee members had a number of questions regarding the increased payback period (from 11 years to 14.5 years). They asked whether the AEC could cover the difference and AEC said that they had not budgeted for the difference. They also asked if they could delay and AEC indicated that a delay at this point would delay installation of the doors (and resulting energy and maintenance savings) for a year and that the current doors are 20 years old and could malfunction during that period. Also, what is the estimated annual savings versus the cost of debt service? And is there an additional annual savings beyond the payback period due to the longer lifespan of the equipment? (In this case, yes, since the lifespan of the current doors is already at 20 years).

After several additional questions, several subcommittee members indicated that they see the need for the subcommittee to further delineate the subcommittee's criteria for (as well as possible exceptions to) acceptable project payback and return on investment for future SMART Fund proposals. Until that criteria is established they said they felt it was arbitrary to deny this project since they had approved it at \$160,000 with an 11 year payback period. And they also saw the operational savings and energy savings benefits of this project and the need to get the doors replaced soon.

The topic of establishing payback criteria will be on the October meeting agenda and subcommittee members are asked to come with ideas to proposed for payback criteria.

A motion was made by HENDRICK, seconded by ERICKSON, that this Action Item be recommended for denial. The motion failed by the following vote:

Ayes: 2 - ERICKSON and HENDRICK

Noes: 5 - MANDLI, SCHMIDT, MERRITT, PABELLON and RIPP

Excused: 1 - CONNORS

After further discussion, Supervisor Schmidt and other subcommittee members said that they would vote to approve but that they want payback criteria discussed and selected at the next subcommittee meeting, and that Sup. Schmidt would like the subcommittee to consider at that time a criterion that requires project cost sharing from the department for items that are close to the end of their lifespan and/or that have a higher payback period in order to maximize the SMART Funds.

A motion was made by RIPP, seconded by PABELLON, that the Action Item be approved and that the award be increased to \$212,825. The motion carried by a voice vote.

D. Presentations

NONE

E. Reports to Committee

NONE

F. Future Meeting Items and Dates

October--staff will send out a scheduling poll for the Round 3 meeting of the subcommittee.

G. Public Comment on Items not on the Agenda

NONE

H. Such Other Business as Allowed by Law

MacKinnon gave a brief update on the progress of the new Waste Reduction and Recycling system being rolled out at all county facilities. CCB's system has been in place for about a week and we have received very positive responses from staff. Facilities Management is already seeing a surprisingly quick reduction in materials going to the trash compactor, which they anticipate should allow us to reduce trash pickup to once every two weeks to save money.

I. Adjourn

The meeting adjourned at 12:40 p.m.

A motion was made by RIPP, seconded by PABELLON, that the meeting be adjourned. The motion carried by a voice vote.

NOTE: If you need an interpreter, translator, materials in alternate formats or other accommodations to access this service, activity or program, please call the phone number below at least three business days prior to the meeting.

NOTA: Si necesita un intérprete, un traductor, materiales en formatos alternativos u otros arreglos para acceder a este servicio, actividad o programa, comuníquese al número de teléfono que figura a continuación tres días hábiles como mínimo antes de la reunión.

LUS CIM: Yog hais tias koj xav tau ib tug neeg txhais lus, ib tug neeg txhais ntawv, cov ntawv ua lwm hom ntawv los sis lwm cov kev pab kom siv tau cov kev pab, cov kev ua ub no (activity) los sis qhov kev pab cuam, thov hu rau tus xov tooj hauv qab yam tsawg peb hnuv ua hauj lwm ua ntej yuav tuaj sib tham.

County Board Office (608) 266-5758 TTY WI RELAY 711